Comparison of impact of managers' participative and collaborative management styles on creativity, job satisfaction and organizational commitment of secondary school teachers, Rasht city, Iran

Mohammad Hadi Asgari¹ and Hossein Hasanpour²

1. Department of Business Management and Accounting, Tonekabon branch, Islamic Azad University, Tonekabon, Mazandaran, Iran
2. M.A Student of Educational Management, Tonekabon branch, Islamic Azad University, Tonekabon, Mazandaran, Iran

Corresponding author: Hossein Hasanpour

ABSTRACT: The present research tries to compare impact of managers' participative and collaborative management styles on creativity, job satisfaction and organizational commitment of secondary school teachers in Rasht city, Iran. Its method is causal-comparative and it is an applied research from objective point of view. Statistical population is all secondary schools teachers of Rasht city. Krejcie and Morgan table was used to determine sample size which was 386 people. For managers' population a census was conducted. Data gathering tool was questionnaire and its reliability was investigated by Chronbach's alpha. Research validity was evaluated through consulting with commentators and experts. Independent t-test was used to compare the two groups and test the main and subsidiary hypotheses.

Keywords: job satisfaction, organizational commitment, creativity, participative and collaborative management styles.

INTRODUCTION

Education has an important role in development process as one of the sub-systems of a society. Such a system that is development-producing and driving motor of all development dimensions requires internal development. In internal development process of education system, changes in structure, goals and methods are inevitable. Study of present circumstances of organizations or educational environment indicate many problems and setbacks ahead of establishing a suitable atmosphere for developing creative thinking, initiative and problem solving solution (Kamali, 1999). That is because creativity and innovation are causes of organizational growth, productivity improvement, service and products quality increase, success in competition, employees motivational increase and their job satisfaction, costs decrease, variety of products and service, decrease in bureaucracy and increase in pragmatism. Therefore organizations must try their best to do researches in order to encourage and institutionalize creativity and innovation (Esmi, 2006). Investigation of scientific studies on various management styles and theories show that many creative and innovative motivations and creative works have been affected by managerial styles and theories. Considering what stated above, this research will investigate relationship between participative and collaborative management styles and creativity, organizational commitment and job satisfaction of teachers of Rasht city secondary schools.

Theoretical framework and conceptual model of research

Educational organizations and especially educational systems have a great role in human beings life. Present of innovative and creative individuals in educational system and other educational and scientific centers is of great importance, because organizations have important roles in educating committed and knowledgeable workforce for other organizations. Therefore the current educational system must be different from traditional educations (Pirkhanghi, 2004). In today's organizations, success is largely dependent on creativity, innovation, discovery and invention. Considering the existing requirements, organizations are encouraged to exercise...
change both in individual and organizational levels and these changes seem to be evolved in the form of new and useful thoughts and ideas (Martins and Terblanche, 2003).

Bently defines creativity as applying knowledge and skills in new ways in order to achieve valuable results (Bently, 2002). Juny in a research titled "Transformational and pragmatic leadership and its impact on group's creativity" concludes that individuals creativity will increase under transformational leadership significantly with respect to pragmatic management (Jung, 2001). Amabile and Gryskiewicz2 believe that managers are background factors in work environment and influence creativity. On the other hand, a manager or president's behavior whose duty is leadership will affect employees’ thoughts, feelings and ambitions which cause motivation and directing their behavior. Therefore leadership style, as a facilitating and motivating factor, affect work efficiency of the organizational (Amabile and Gryskiewicz, 1996). In Jung opinion, management means influencing individuals and intra-organizational groups, helping them with setting targets and guiding them through achieving goals (Jung, 2001).

Dian conducted a research on the existence of implicit evidence on relationship between management styles in England and concluded that organizational culture and management styles are related with organization members' performance (Dian, 2004).

Benjamin believes that management deformation in increase and selection of optimal performance evaluation along with transformational style is more effective compared with those who only do repetitive evaluation (those who judge and compare before starting work) (Benjamin, 2006). Investigation of researchers which have been conducted on various management styles and theories shows that many motivations and innovative and creative spirits and works are influenced by managerial theories and styles. Many individuals are natively creative and innovative but if they work in organizations which have mechanical structure and are affected by classic theory and collaborative management style, their innovation and creativity process will be incomplete and suppressed. In an organization with bureaucratic structure, an innovative manager will also get nowhere. Presence of creative and innovative manager and employees is not enough and structure, strategy, environment, technology, life cycle and size, human resource control power, culture and authorities must support innovation (ogbonna, 2000). Andriopoulos(2001) believes that 5 important organizational factors that increase creativity in an organization are as follows:

1) Organizational atmosphere,
2) Leadership style,
3) Organizational culture,
4) Resources and skills,
5) Organizational structure and systems.

Management experts and commentators unanimously agree that participative and democratic styles increase creativity while traditional (collaborative) management style possibly reduces it. Kouk suggests that managers had better help develop creativity from every formal or informal channel and they must continuously encourage their employees to think and act beyond their current knowledge and ability. On the other hand, many researchers believe that management style and behavior influence organization, commitment, and employees satisfaction and dependence (Rokninejad, 2007). The most common way of dealing with organizational commitment is that organizational commitment is considered as an emotional dependence of individual on his/her organization. Therefore, a very committed person takes his/her identity from his/her organization, participates in the organization's affairs and enjoys from being a member of the organization (Saronghi, 1996). Organizational commitment is defined as emotional support for an organization's values and aims, for the sake of organization itself and away from its instrumental values (a means to achieve other goals) (Ranjbarian, 1996). In other words, organizational commitment is all positive and negative approaches of individuals towards the whole organization (not job) they are working in. when someone is committed to his/her organization, he/she is more loyal to his/her organization and recognizes the organization through that.

According to Adam’s equity theory, when employees feel they are being treated unfairly, they do some activities with the aim of reforming unjust behavior feeling, therefore if rewards are fairly from employees point of view, they will be more satisfied, because they feel they have been rewarded based on their efforts (Davis and Nyvastvrm, 1991). Therefore satisfaction level affect commitment and commitment affect his/her performance and effort. According to Vroom theory, 3 factors, i.e. rewards value, relationship between rewards and performance, and necessary effort for performance affect behavior. Therefore, motivation is largely affected by individuals’ perceptions of behavior results and this can affect individual's future behavior, including his/her commitment (Moghimi, 1998: 231). According to Marshal Theory, as organizational participation increase in four organizational dimensions and levels, organizational belonging and empathy feeling and commitment is increased in addition, organizational participation increase individuals respect and this can affect individuals’ organizational commitment (Chalabi, 2006). Therefore, organizational structure can affect employees’ commitment to a large extent. The main question of this research is therefore: (whether there is any significant difference between participative and collaborative management styles influence on creativity, job satisfaction

1082
and organizational commitment of Rasht city secondary schools teachers?) research's conceptual model is represented in figure 1.

![Research Conceptual Model](image)

**Research Hypotheses**

**Research Main Hypothesis**

There is difference between creativity, job satisfaction and organizational commitment of teachers in schools with participative and collaborative management styles.

**Research Subsidiary Hypotheses**

1) There is difference between creativity of teachers in schools with participative and collaborative management styles.
2) There is difference between job satisfaction of teachers in schools with participative and collaborative management styles.
3) There is difference between organizational commitment of teachers in schools with participative and collaborative management styles.

**Research Methodology**

This research's method is causal-comparative and it is an applied research from objective point of view. Statistical population was all secondary schools teachers of Rasht city. Krejcie and Morgan table was used to determine sample size which was 386 people. For managers' population a census was conducted. Data gathering tool was questionnaire and its reliability was investigated by Cronbach's alpha. Sample size was obtained 386 and after gathering questionnaires, due to incomplete and flawed information in some questionnaires, 353 questionnaires of teachers were analyzed. Accidental-categorical sampling method was used as sampling method.
RESEARCH RESULTS

First subsidiary hypothesis
There is difference between creativity of teachers in schools with participative and collaborative management styles.

Table 1. Statistical characteristics of sample members concerning creativity variable and the results of independent t-test

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Validity level</th>
<th>f value</th>
<th>T value</th>
<th>Standard deviation</th>
<th>number</th>
<th>average</th>
<th>groups</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0/001</td>
<td>0/029</td>
<td>25/283</td>
<td>1/54862</td>
<td>256</td>
<td>20/8047</td>
<td>Participative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>management style</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0/001</td>
<td>0/029</td>
<td>25/283</td>
<td>0/85472</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>11/1294</td>
<td>Collaborative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>management style</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In view of the fact that calculated value for validity level is less than the highest acceptable value for hypothesis verification, (P= 0.05), therefore it can be concluded that the first hypothesis, i.e. is verified. Calculated means for the two groups that were under collaborative and participative management styles was 20.8047 and 11.1294 respectively. This means those individuals who are under participative management, are more creative than those who are under collaborative management. (it must be mentioned that as table 10.4 shows, creativity level is less than average in both groups).

Second subsidiary hypothesis
There is difference between job satisfaction of teachers in schools with participative and collaborative management styles.

Table 2. Statistical characteristics of sample members concerning job satisfaction variable and the results of independent t-test

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Validity level</th>
<th>f value</th>
<th>T value</th>
<th>Standard deviation</th>
<th>number</th>
<th>average</th>
<th>groups</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0/001</td>
<td>0/018</td>
<td>5/689</td>
<td>1/05375</td>
<td>256</td>
<td>1/9701</td>
<td>Participative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>management style</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0/001</td>
<td>0/018</td>
<td>5/689</td>
<td>0/98547</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>1/6245</td>
<td>Collaborative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>management style</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In view of the fact that calculated value for validity level is less than the highest acceptable value for hypothesis verification, (P= 0.05), therefore it can be concluded that the second hypothesis is verified. Calculated means for the two groups that were under collaborative and participative management styles was 1.9701 and 1.6245 respectively. This means those individuals who are under participative management, have higher level of job satisfaction than those who are under collaborative management.

Third subsidiary hypothesis
There is difference between organizational commitment of teachers in schools with participative and collaborative management styles.

Table 3. Statistical characteristics of sample members concerning organizational commitment variable and the results of independent t-test

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Validity level</th>
<th>f value</th>
<th>T value</th>
<th>Standard deviation</th>
<th>number</th>
<th>average</th>
<th>groups</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0/001</td>
<td>0/002</td>
<td>14/175</td>
<td>0/95842</td>
<td>256</td>
<td>4/0101</td>
<td>Participative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>management style</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0/001</td>
<td>0/002</td>
<td>14/175</td>
<td>0/847569</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>3/4215</td>
<td>Collaborative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>management style</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In view of the fact that calculated value for validity level is less than the highest acceptable value for hypothesis verification, (P= 0.05), therefore it can be concluded that the third subsidiary hypothesis is verified. Calculated means for the two groups that were under collaborative and participative management styles was 3.4215 and 4.0101 respectively. This means those individuals who are under participative management, have higher level of organizational commitment than those who are under collaborative management.

Research main hypothesis
There is difference between creativity, job satisfaction and organizational commitment of teachers in schools with participative and collaborative management styles.

Results of separate mean difference test between each of variables creativity, job satisfaction and organizational commitment of Rasht city secondary schools teachers with their management style indicate that a significant difference exists. In other words, teachers who were under participative management style had a higher level of creativity, job satisfaction, and organizational commitment compared with those teachers who were under collaborative management style. Therefore the results of mean-difference t-test show that the main hypothesis of the research is verified.
CONCLUSION

Results of the first subsidiary hypothesis test showed that there is difference between creativity level of schools teachers with participative and collaborative management style.

This conclusion can be compared with that of Ghafari's research (2009). He investigated relationship between creativity and managers management style in a research titled "relationship between physical education managers' leadership style and teachers' creativity". His results prove a relationship between the two variables. His results indicated that leadership style is a facilitating and motivating factor and affects teachers' creativity directly and indirectly. Furthermore, the results of the present research can be compared with the results of Feizi's research results (2009) titled "investigation of relationship between managers' management styles and teachers' activity in Sanandaj high schools". Feizi's research results prove a direct relationship between participative management style and creativity increase in teachers.

Results of the second subsidiary hypothesis test showed that there exists difference between creativity levels of teachers in schools with participative management styles. This result can be compared with the results of Bashir's research (2009) titled "investigation of traditional and participative management styles impact on organizational commitment of Kermanshah's high schools teachers". He came to this conclusion that there is positive significant relationship between participative management style and organizational commitment of teachers. Furthermore, female managers have more impact on teachers' organizational commitment compared with male teachers and as managers use bilateral and open communications, friendly relationship and delegation of authority to teachers, organizational commitment level will increase.

Results of the third hypothesis test showed that there is a difference between creativity level of the teachers in schools with participative and collaborative management styles. The results of this research can be compared with the results of a research conducted by Fayi (1999) titled "investigation of relationship between managers' management styles and job satisfaction of Semnan province high schools teachers". The results of Fayi's research indicated that there is significant relationship between participative management style and educational creativity, favorable human relations establishment and job satisfaction.

Results of the main hypothesis test showed that separate mean difference test between each of the variables creativity, job satisfaction and organizational commitment of Rasht city secondary schools teachers and management style of their managers prove significant mean difference between the variables based on participative and collaborative management styles. Level of creativity, job satisfaction and organizational commitment of teachers in schools with participative management styles was higher that that of schools with collaborative management. It must be mentioned that in comparing the results of the present research with similar studies, the researcher found no similar research in which relationship between collaborative and participative management styles and creativity, organizational commitment and job satisfaction of teachers was studied and many of the studies had dealt with the relationship between one of the variables and managerial styles. But the results of the studies generally prove relationship between management styles and creativity, job satisfaction, organizational commitment, motivational factors, etc. therefore verification of this research hypothesis match the results of theoretical literature.

REFERENCES